Education Audit Appeals Panel State of California

Appeal of 2015-16 Audit Finding 2016-002 by: El Centro Elementary School District,

EAAP Case No. 17-03

OAH No. 2017080637

Decision

The Education Audit Appeals Panel has adopted the attached Stipulated Agreement of the parties as its Decision in the above-entitled matter.

Appellant.

Effective date: 3/24/2015.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Joel Montero, Chairperson

for Education Audit Appeals Panel

- 1	d .	
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California RICHARD T. WALDOW Supervising Deputy Attorney General KRISTEN T. DALESSIO Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 149081 600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101 Telephone: (619) 738-9551 Fax: (619) 645-2581 E-mail: Kristen.Dalessio@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Intervenor Department of Finance	
9	BEFORE THE EDUCATION	N AUDIT APPEALS PANEL
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
11		
12		FLAD GOVERNMENT OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERT
13	In the Matter of the Audit Appeal of: Appeal of Fiscal Year 2015-2016 Audit	EAAP Case No.: EAAP 17-03
14	Finding 2016-002 by EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT,	OAH Case No. 2017080637
	Appellant,	STIPULATION AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT
15	ν,	
16	v.	
17	CALIFORNIA STATE CONTROLLER,	
18	Respondent.	
19		
20	Appellant EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY	SCHOOL DISTRICT (Appellant), Respondent
21	BETTY YEE, California State Controller, (SCO), and Intervenor DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE	
22	(Finance) (collectively, the parties, and individually, each, a party) agree to a complete settlement	
23	of the above-captioned matter as follows:	
24	111	RECEIVED
25	111	,1AN 8 2010
26		37AN 8 2018
27		EDUCATION AUDIT
28		APPEALS PANEL

RECITALS

- A. The independent accounting firm of Wilkinson Hadley King & Co., L.L.P. (Auditor) conducted an annual financial compliance audit of the Appellant for the fiscal year of 2015-16, the results of which were included in the final audit report issued on or about June 30, 2016.
- B. In Audit Finding 2016-002, the Auditor determined that Appellant's independent study master agreements (agreements) did not meet all of the requirements of state law. Specifically, the agreements did not contain the manner, time, frequency, and place for submitting a student's assignments and for reporting the student's progress and the methods utilized to evaluate the work. As a result, the auditor disallowed \$715,636 received by the Appellant for the 2015-2016 fiscal year.
 - C. The SCO certified the subject audit and audit report and audit finding.
- D. Appellant timely filed a request for formal appeal of Audit Finding 2016-002 (the Appeal) pursuant to Education Code section 41344, subdivision (d), instituting the Appeal before the Education Audit Appeals Panel (EAAP).
 - E. Finance intervened pursuant to Education Code section 41344.1, subdivision (b).
- F. To avoid the cost and uncertainty of litigation, the parties to this case agree to completely resolve this dispute on the terms and conditions described below.

AGREEMENT

For the purpose of completely settling and resolving the Appeal, the parties, without any admission of liability or wrongdoing, except as provided in section 1 herein, and in furtherance thereof, do agree as set forth below:

- 1. The disallowed amount of \$715,636 shall be reduced to the sum of \$180,000.00.
- 2. Appellant shall repay in full satisfaction of Audit Finding 2016-002 the sum of \$180,000.00, without interest over a period of eight years, or approximately \$22,500.00 annually, commencing with its next principal apportionment following EAAP approving and adopting the settlement.
- 3. This agreement fully and completely resolves all claims, demands, appeals, obligations, or causes of action arising from or relating to Audit Finding 2016-002. Accordingly,

the parties expressly waive any right or claim to assert or pursue thereafter any claim, demand, obligation, and/or cause of action relating to Audit Finding 2016-002.

- 4. This agreement is subject to and conditioned upon approval and adoption by EAAP, pursuant to Education Code section 41344.1, subdivision (b) and upon ratification by the Appellant's Governing Board.
- 5. This agreement may be executed in counterparts, each of which shall constitute an original. Facsimile and .pdf signatures by the parties and/or their designated representatives are deemed the equivalent of original signatures.
 - 6. The parties shall bear their own attorneys' fees and costs relative to the Appeal.

	1 .	
1	Dated: 1/4/17	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
2		
3		By: William B. Tunick, Esq.
4		DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY Attorneys for El Centro Elementary School District
5		District
6 7	Dated:	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
8		
9		By: Officer of Governing Board El Centro Elementary School District
10		El Cellio Elemental y School District
11		
12	Dated:	OFFICE OF THE STATE CONTROLLER
13		By: JOHN DICKERSON Counsel for Hon, Betty Yee
14		Counsel for Hon. Betty Yee State Controller
15 16	Dated:	DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
17 18		By: JEFF BELL Program Budget Manager Department of Finance
19	APPROVED AS TO FORM ONLY	
20	Dated:	XAVIER BECERRA
21		California Attorney General
22		RICHARD T. WALDOW Supervising Deputy Attorney General
23		Ву:
24	,	KRISTEN T. DALESSIO Deputy Attorney General
25		Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Department of Finance
26	070019505010	
27	SD2017506818 El Centro Settlement Agreement Draft.docs	4
28		

1 2	Dated: 12/4/17	EL CENTRO BLEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
3		By
4		William B. Tunick, Esq. DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY
5		Attorneys for El Centro Elementary School District
6	101.01.0	
7	Dated: 12/12/17	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
8		9 4 9
9		By: Office of Governing Board
10		El Gentro Elementary School District
11	Dec 1	OFFICE OF THE STATE CONTROLLER
12	Dated:	OFFICE OF THE STATE CONTROLLER
13		By: JOHN DICKERSON
14		Counsel for Hon, Betty Yee State Controller
15	Dated: 21 NOV 17	DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
16	Dated.	\bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc
17		By: JEFF BELL
18		Program Budget Manager Department of Finance
19	APPROVED AS TO FORM ONLY	•,
20	Dated: Novamble 17,2017	XAVIER BECERRA
21		California Attorney General
22		RICHARD T. WALDOW Supervising Deputy Attorney General
23		By Rate To I alissio
24	×	KRISTEN T. DALESSIO Deputy Attorney-General
25		Attorneys for Department of Finance
26	SD2017506818	
27	El Centro Settlement Agreement Draft.docs	
28	1	

1	Dated:	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
2		
3		By: William B. Tunick, Esq. DANNIS WOLLVER KELLEY
4		DANNIS WOLIVÉR KELLEY Attorneys for El Centro Elementary School District
6		4.17. 3
7	Dated:	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
8		D
9		By: Officer of Governing Board El Centro Elementary School District
10		÷
11	Dated: 11-21-2017	OFFICE OF THE STATE CONTROLLER
13		By: JOHN DICKERSON
14		Counsel for Hon. Betty Yee State Controller
15	Dated:	DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
		D
17 18		By: JEFF BELL Program Budget Manager
19		Department of Finance
20	APPROVED AS TO FORM ONLY	
21	Dated: Novamble 17,2017	XAVIER BECERRA
22		California Attorney General RICHARD T. WALDOW
23		Supervising Deputy Attorney General
24		KRISTEN T. DALESSIO
25		Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Department of Finance
26		
27	SD2017506818 El Centro Settlement Agreement Draft.docs	
28		

1 2	Dated:	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
		D
3 4	¥	By: William B. Tunick, Esq. DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY
5		Attorneys for El Centro Elementary School District
6		
7	Dated:	EL CENTRO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT
8		_
9		By:
10		
11	Dated:	OFFICE OF THE STATE CONTROLLER
12		
13		By: JOHN DICKERSON
14		Counsel for Hon. Betty Yee State Controller
15	Dated: 21 NOV 17	DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
16		\bigcirc
17		By: JEFF BELL
18		Program Budget Manager Department of Finance
19	ADDROVED AS TO EGRALOW V	Department of Finance
20	APPROVED AS TO FORM ONLY	
21	Dated: Novamble 17,2017	XAVIER BECERRA California Attorney General
22		RICHARD T. WALDOW
23		Supervising Deputy Attorney General
24		By: KRISTEN T. DALESSIO
25	*	Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Department of Finance
26		
27	SD2017506818 El Centro Settlement Agreement Draft.docs	
28	3	